Plenary Debates of the Parliament of Finland as Linked Open Data and in Parla-CLARIN Markup

- ₃ Laura Sinikallio 🖂 💿
- 4 University of Helsinki, HELDIG Centre for Digital Humanities, SeCo Research Group, Finland
- 5 Senka Drobac 🖂 💿
- 6 Aalto University, Department of Computer Science, SeCo Research Group, Finland
- 7 Minna Tamper 🖂 🕩
- 8 Aalto University, Department of Computer Science, SeCo Research Group, Finland
- , Rafael Leal 🖂 🖻
- ¹⁰ University of Helsinki, HELDIG Centre for Digital Humanities, SeCo Research Group, Finland
- 11 Mikko Koho 🖂 💿
- ¹² University of Helsinki, HELDIG Centre for Digital Humanities, SeCo Research Group, Finland
- ¹³ Jouni Tuominen ⊠©
- 14 Aalto University and University of Helsinki (HELDIG), SeCo Research Group, Finland
- 15 Matti La Mela 🖂 🕩
- ¹⁶ University of Helsinki, HELDIG Centre for Digital Humanities, SeCo Research Group, Finland
- ¹⁷ Eero Hyvönen ⊠ ^[D]
- 18 Aalto University and University of Helsinki (HELDIG), SeCo Research Group, Finland
- ¹⁹ Abstract

This paper presents a knowledge graph created by transforming the plenary debates of the Parliament 20 of Finland (1907-) into Linked Open Data (LOD). The data, totaling over 900 000 speeches, with 21 automatically created semantic annotations and rich ontology-based metadata, are published in 22 a Linked Open Data Service and are used via a SPARQL API and as data dumps. The speech 23 data is part of larger LOD publication FinnParla that also includes prosopographical data about 24 the politicians. The data is being used for studying parliamentary language and culture in Digital 25 26 Humanities in several universities. To serve a wider variety of users, the entirety of this data was also 27 produced using Parla-CLARIN markup. We present the first publication of all Finnish parliamentary debates as data. Technical novelties in our approach include the use of both Parla-CLARIN and an 28 RDF schema developed for representing the speeches, integration of the data to a new Parliament 29 of Finland Ontology for deeper data analyses, and enriching the data with a variety of external 30 national and international data sources. 31

- ³² 2012 ACM Subject Classification Information systems \rightarrow Ontologies; Information systems \rightarrow ³³ Resource Description Framework (RDF); Computing methodologies \rightarrow Information extraction
- Keywords and phrases Plenary debates, parliamentary data, Parla-CLARIN, Linked Open Data,
 Digital Humanities
- ³⁶ Digital Object Identifier 10.4230/OASIcs.LDK.2021.12

³⁷ **1** Introduction

- ³⁸ Semantic Parliament (SEMPARL)¹ is a consortium research project, which produces a
- ³⁹ linked open data and research infrastructure on Finnish parliamentary data, and develops
- ⁴⁰ novel semantic computing technologies to study parliamentary politics and political culture.

Editors: Dagmar Gromann, Gilles Sérasset, Thiery Declerck, John P. McCrae, Jorge Gracia, Julia Bosque-Gil, Fernando Bobillo, and Barbara Heinisch; Article No. 12; pp. 12:1–12:17



OpenAccess Series in Informatics OASICS Schloss Dagstuhl – Leibniz-Zentrum für Informatik, Dagstuhl Publishing, Germany

¹ https://seco.cs.aalto.fi/projects/semparl/en/

[©] Laura Sinikallio, Senka Drobac, Minna Tamper, Rafael Leal, Mikko Koho, Jouni Tuominen, Matti La Mela and Eero Hyvönen;

licensed under Creative Commons License CC-BY 4.0 3rd Conference on Language, Data and Knowledge (LDK 2021).

12:2 Plenary Debates as a LOD Knowledge Graph and Parla-CLARIN markup

41 SEMPARL brings together researchers at the University of Helsinki, University of Turku, and
 42 Aalto University, with complementary, multi-disciplinary expertise in language technology,

43 political and media research, and semantic computing and web technologies, respectively.

The project makes three major contributions. First, it responds to the demand for an 44 easy to use and "intelligent" access to the newly digitized Finnish parliamentary data by 45 providing the data as a national Linked Open Data (LOD) infrastructure and service for 46 researchers, citizens, the government, and the media, and application developers. Second, 47 the project studies long-term changes in the Finnish parliamentary and political culture and 48 language. These use cases in political and language research are pioneering studies using 49 the Finnish digital parliamentary data. Third, the new data service semantically enriches 50 content in other related Finnish LOD services, such as LawSampo for Finnish legislation and 51 case law [7] and BiographySampo for prosopographical data [6]. 52

From a Linked Data production point of, two interlinked knowledge graphs (KG) are 53 produced in SEMPARL: 1) A KG of all over 900 000 parliamentary debate speeches of 54 the Parliament of Finland (PoF) (1907-present) to be called S-KG. 2) A prosopographical 55 knowledge (P-KG) graph of the over 2600 Members of Parliament (MP), other people, and 56 organizations related to the parliamentary speeches during the same period of time [16]. 57 These KGs constitute together a larger data publication of PoF data called FinnParla. This 58 paper presents the first graph S-KG and addresses the following more general research 59 question: How to represent and publish parliamentary speeches so that the data can be used 60 easily for Digital Humanities research? 61

In the following, we first present the problem of representing publishing, and using plenary 62 debates as data for Digital Humanities research, and discuss related works and projects. 63 After this, our original debate data, target data model, and the transformation process are 64 described. The produced linked data has been published as a data service using the 7-star 65 model of the Linked Data Finland platform [8]. As a demonstration of using the data service 66 in Digital Humanities research, exemplary data-analyses are presented using YASGUI and 67 Google Colab on top of the underlying SPARQL endpoint. In conclusion, contributions of 68 the work are summarized, related works are discussed, and further research are outlined. 60

70 2 Related Work: Publishing Plenary Debates as Data

The Unicameral Parliament of Finland convened for the first time in 1907. The parliament 71 has 200 members (MP), who are elected for four years. Since the first parliament of 1907, the 72 elections are based on universal suffrage and both male and female MPs have been elected 73 to all parliaments. In the Finnish parliament, the debates take place in the public plenary 74 sessions. Since 1907, the Parliament has transcribed the speeches and published the printed 75 plenary session minutes, which is a practice established already in the nineteenth-century Diet 76 of Estates [20]. The minutes contain the matters considered, the decisions made, and every 77 speech heard during the sessions. The wordings of the speeches are revised and improved for 78 readability. [29, 20]. 79

In the 1990s, the Parliament of Finland started to gradually publish parliamentary documents in digital form. It was only in 2018 that the Parliament completed the digitisation of the historical parliamentary documents of 1907–1999 and opened a new version of their data service [10]. This open data and the data service of the Parliament, however, has weaknesses concerning the data and its usability due to the heterogeneous data formats and different ways of access. For example, the historical minutes contain only the text recognised from the image files, and have no metadata concerning the structure of the minutes or their

⁸⁷ content, which limits the research to bag-of-words approaches [14].

⁸⁸ There are also annotated corpora produced of the Finnish Parliamentary debates, which

⁸⁹ cover the recent decades. FIN-CLARIN has a curated corpus of the debates in 2008–2016 [3].

⁹⁰ These include linguistic annotation, metadata about the speakers and the speeches are linked

to the actual video recordings of the plenary sessions. Moreover, there is the multilingual Parlspeech parliamentary corpus [21], which includes also the plenary debates of the Finnish parliament in 1991–2015. This data, however, has quality problems. It has been created from the PDF files of the Parliament website of the time, but not all the speeches can be found in the data when we compare it with the complete minutes.

Several projects have transformed parliamentary debates into structured data or produced 96 annotated parliamentary debate corpora. Regarding the former, the projects have foremost 97 concerned the digitisation of the parliamentary debates and their enrichment with political or 98 biographical metadata. These data have been transformed both to XML and RDF format². 99 In the Lipad project, the Canadian Hansard from 1901 to present was transformed into 100 linked XML structured data [1]. As in our case, the process included both the OCR and 101 the parsing of the historical documents and more straight-forward conversion of the recent 102 SQL parliamentary data. The major example of parliamentary data in RDF is the Linked 103 EP project, where the data of the European parliament 1999–2017 was transformed into 104 RDF format and enriched with biographical information [28]. The RDF standard has been 105 used also in the Latvian LinkedSAEIMA project [2], in the Italian Parliament³ and in the 106 PoliMedia project, where RDF parliamentary data was linked with media sources [11]. 107

There are several parliamentary corpora. The best known is perhaps the EuroParl 108 corpus, which includes the plenary session debates of the European Parliament and has been 109 used to study machine translation [12]. A comprehensive list of the national parliamentary 110 corpora is presented on the CLARIN webpage⁴. The Talk of Norway (1998–2016) is an 111 example of a national parliament corpus with linguistic annotation published in CSV and 112 TSV formats. [15] Different guidelines have been followed for annotating and encoding the 113 Parliamentary debates. The TEI-based Parla-CLARIN schema, which we also use in our 114 transformation, is an attempt to define a common annotation model.⁵ For example, the 115 Slovene parliamentary corpus siParl (1990–2018) has been encoded with the Parla-CLARIN 116 schema [19]. Currently, the Parla-CLARIN schema is implemented in the Clarin ParlaMint 117 project⁶, which establishes a comparable and interoperable corpus of almost twenty national 118 parliamentary corpora for comparative research. 119

A novelty in the transformation done in our SEMPARL project is to combine RDF standard with Parla-CLARIN schema. Moreover, most of the annotated parliamentary corpora cover mainly the recent years while in our case the complete work of the PoF from 1907 is covered—and for the first time.

124 **3** Original Data

The original data, minutes of Finnish plenary sessions, was gathered from several sources and in three different formats depending on the availability: 1) From 1907 to 1999⁷ the plenary

² https://www.w3.org/RDF/

³ http://data.camera.it/data/en/datasets/

⁴ https://www.clarin.eu/resource-families/parliamentary-corpora

⁵ See: https://www.clarin.eu/blog/clarin-parlaformat-workshop

⁶ https://github.com/clarin-eric/ParlaMint

⁷ There is no data for 1915 and 1916 as due to war the Parliament did not convene.

12:4 Plenary Debates as a LOD Knowledge Graph and Parla-CLARIN markup

session minutes are available only in PDF format⁸. One parliamentary session is split into
1-8 separate PDF files, each containing the minutes for several plenary sessions. 2) From
halfway parliamentary session 1999 to the end of session 2014, the data is available also in
HTML format at PoF's web pages⁹. 3) From session 2015 onward the plenary sessions are
available as XML from the Avoin eduskunta API¹⁰.

Figure 1 shows an example of original PDF-format minutes for plenary session 87/1989¹¹. Later minutes available in HTML and XML also mostly follow shown layout and logic; In general, the minutes consist of items (or topics), marked here in bold (except the row *Keskustelu:*). The item header is followed by: a possible list of related documents, chairman's opening comments, a possible debate section marked by *Keskustelu:* (*debate/conversation*) and finally a decision and a closing statement.

Figure 1 Example of a plenary session transcript. Available by the CC BY 4.0 licence.

2624 Perjantaina 29.	syyskuuta 1989	Hoitovapaa			
Ensimmäinen varapuhemies: Kyöksunnan oiksudesta tarkastan valitönen tövstön jäsenten ja oikeuskanslerin virkatoin töväs määnä keskustelutta lähetettävä perusta- tassakustelutta lähetettään perustuslakivata- tossakustelutta lähetettään perustuslakivata- tiokuntaan. Mirelmä lähetettään perustuslakivata- tiokuntaan. Oy Yeisradio Aba hallintoneuvoston täy- tossakustaja keskustelutta lähetettävä perustuslakivata- tiokuntaan. Oy Yeisradio Aba hallintoneuvoston täy- tossakustaja keskustassakustass	<text><text><text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text></text></text>	<text><text><text><text><text></text></text></text></text></text>	amisesta Mielestäni esitys tulisi saada kä- tukaan aultion vuoden 1991 tulo- ja me- bartukaan aultion vuoden 1991 tulo- ja me- tukaan aultion vuoden 1991 tulo- ja me- tukaan aultion vuoden 1991 tulo- ja me- merkitystä kaikki se. mutia tämä esitys dy dikäkjää pubenvuoron. Kun hoitova- aulti autossa jää huoniomaanta oli se, etä si kuoniomaanta oli se, si kuonio etä si kuoniomaanta oli se, si kuonion si kuonionaanta oli se, si kuonion si kuonionaanta oli se, si kuonion si se settä simä pää kuonio kuonion si se settä simä pää kuonion se si suonaanta oli se settä simä pää kuonion si se settä simä pää kuonion si se settä simä pää kuonion si se settä simä pää kuonion si settä si se settä simä pää kuonion si se settä simä pää kuonion se si suonaanta, että simä pää kuonion si se settä simä pää kuonion sin se settä simä se settä sim se settä sin se settä simä se settä sim se settä sin se se settä simä se settä sim se settä sin se settä sim se settä sim se settä sin se settä sim se settä sin se settä sim se settä sim se settä sin se settä sim se settä sin se settä sim se settä sim se settä sin se settä sin se se settä sin se settä sin se se settä sin se settä si se s		

Each source format differs in the metadata included. All formats contained the essential data, such as plenary session id, date, debate topic, speaker's last name, and role. The newer machine readable formats have been enriched with additional data, such as URLs to documents related to the debate topics or even individual starting and ending times for a

¹⁴² speech. Table 1 illustrates the metadata present in each format and distribution of used

⁸ https://avoindata.eduskunta.fi/#/fi/digitoidut/download

⁹ https://www.eduskunta.fi/FI/taysistunto/Sivut/Taysistuntojen-poytakirjat.aspx

¹⁰ https://avoindata.eduskunta.fi/#/fi/home

¹¹ https://s3-eu-west-1.amazonaws.com/eduskunta-asiakirja-original-documents-prod/ suomi/1989/PTK_1989_3.pdf

¹⁴³ source formats.

Table 1 Distribution of used source data format and variant metadata present in it. Row *Ubiquitous metadata* lists metadata that was available in all formats. * HTML became available after plenary session 85/1999.

	Parliamentary	Speed	et fits half	e parting the set	Relation	d document	URU Sossif	in transcript	A Pranscript	a hansoipt	version betatitue Speedlend
PDF	1907-1999*	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
HTML	1999*-2014	X	Х	Х	Х	-	-	-	-	-	-
XML	2015-2020	Х	Х	-	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х	Х
Ubiqui	tous metadata	sess sess type	ion dat ion id, e, relat	te, sess speake ed doc	ion en er last ument	ding an name, s, deba	nd sta speak ite top	rting t er title oic	imes, e, speed	ch	

144 **4** Target Data Model

The goal of the whole data transformation process was to make all data available in a coherent, unified format. In this project we did this twice-fold in Parla-CLARIN XML and RDF. The central unit of the data is a speech; any comment, statement or vocal contribution made during a plenary session¹². The goal of the transformation process was to find all such speeches and all available metadata related to them. Generally we refer to all beforementioned instances as speeches. For full coverage we have also gathered all speeches made by the chairmen. These are mostly about guiding the progression of a session.

The Parla-CLARIN XML format¹³ for representing speech texts is an easily readable chronological presentation of the debate data for both machines and humans. We produced one file per parliamentary session. Listing 1 gives an example of a section from the final data in Parla-CLARIN XML. The excerpt covers the start of the debate on a topic during the plenary session 37/2005.

By transforming all data to RDF as well, we aimed to create the knowledge graph 157 (S-KG) of all parliamentary debate speeches. For this purpose a customised RDF-based 158 metadata schema was created. The schema contains six different, interlinked classes: Speech, 159 Interruption, Item, Session, Document, and Transcript. Speeches were represented as 160 instances of the class Speech with 24 properties (metadata elements) as described in Table 2. 161 Here the default namespace is our own (semparts); bioc refers to the BioCRM schema for 162 representing biographical data [27]; rdfs refers to the RDFS Schema and xsd to the XML 163 Schema of W3C. The column C tells the cardinality of the property, Range the range, 164 and last column the meaning of the property. Table 3 describes in the same way the 165

¹² These do not include interjections, other vocal interruptions or chairman comments made during a speech. In original data these have been embedded into the actual speeches. These were handled in the transformation process as *interruptions*.

¹³https://clarin-eric.github.io/parla-clarin/

12:6 Plenary Debates as a LOD Knowledge Graph and Parla-CLARIN markup

remaining five classes and additionally a seventh class, NamedEntity, that was created by
 post-transformation language analysis.

Listing 1 An abridged excerpt from the Parla-CLARIN data

The data model presented for representing debates is part of a larger Ontology of 215 Parliament of Finland under development in the SEMPARL project. This ontology is 216 based on the CIDOC CRM¹⁴ -based Bio CRM model [27], where parliamentary events are 217 represented in time and place with actors (people, groups, such as parties, and organizations) 218 participating in different roles. The ontology is populated with data extracted from the 219 speech data and databases of PoF [16]. For example, the *:speaker* and *:party* property values 220 in Table 2 are filled with resources taken from the actor graph in the PoF ontology that 221 contains over 2600 MPs, ministers, presidents of Finland, and other prominent people related 222 to the speeches as speakers or mentioned in the texts. In this way, prosopographical data and 223 the speeches can be integrated seamlessly and be used together with the Digital Humanities 224 analyses of the parliamentary data. For example, by using biographical information about 225 the speaker it is possible to investigate how much (s)he has spoken about matters related to 226 his/her own electoral district. 227

5 Transformation Process

Semantic Parliament aggregates data from several disparate source databases into a unified knowledge graph. An overall plan of the data transformation processes of source datasets and the linking of entities between different parts are shown in Figure 2. The source datasets are shown as rectangles on the left side of the transformation pipeline and the RDF-format

¹⁴ https://cidoc-crm.org

Speech					
Element URI	\mathbf{C}	Range	Meaning of the value		
:skos:prefLabel	1	rdf:langString	String label for speech		
:speaker	01^{a}	bioc:Person	Person speaking URI		
:party	01	:Party	Party of the speaker URI		
:partyInSource	01	rdfs:Literal	Party as written in the source if available		
:role	01	:Role	Speaker's role		
:speakerInSource	1	rdfs:Literal	Speaker's name as in source		
:speechOrder	1	xsd:integer	Ordinal of the speech in a session		
:content	1	rdfs:Literal	Speech as text (incl. interruptions)		
dct:language	0*	rdfs:Resource	Recognized languages of the speech		
:speechType	01	:SpeechType	Type of the speech		
:isInterruptedBy	0*	:Interruption	Interruptions during the speech		
dct:date	1	xsd:date	Date of the session		
:startTime	01	xsd:time	Start time of the speech		
:endDate	01	xsd:date	Session end date if not same as date		
:endTime	01	xsd:time	End time of the speech		
:item	01	:Item	Item in agenda/topic of the speech		
:session	1	:Session	Session where the speech was made		
:diary	1	rdfs:Resource	URL of session transcript		
:page	01	xsd:integer	Page number for PDF-based data		
:status	01	:Status	Status of the speech transcription		
:version	01	xsd:decimal	Version of the speech transcription		
:namedEntity	0*	:NamedEntity	Referenced named entities		
dct:subject	0*	skos:Concept	Subject matter keywords		

Table 2 Semparls RDF schema for Speech. ^{*a*}From some source data the chairmen names were not always reliably recognizable. In this case chairman speeches lack this value.

parts are shown as yellow cylinders. The solid arrows depict data transformation and dotted
arrows correspond to entity linking either inside the Semantic Parliament data or to external
ontologies and datasets (shown on the top).

The external ontologies and data shown in Figure 2 are the AMMO ontology of Finnish 236 historical occupations, which is linked to social statuses through the international HISCO stan-237 dard [13], Wikidata, related Finnish Sampo data services and portals¹⁵, such as LawSampo [7] 238 and BiographySampo [6], places, Finto¹⁶ ontologies, EKS subject headings¹⁷ used in the 239 library of PoF. Semantic Finlex [18] data service of Finnish legislation and case law [18], and 240 the Lakitutka¹⁸ service publishing data related to government proposals discussed in the 241 speeches and other documents. These will enrich the content and enhance the usefulness of 242 the speech data for parliamentary research and applications. 243

The step 1 of transforming MP data is discussed in [16]. The step 2 concerning government proposals remains a future work. This paper focuses on the 3. step of the transformation of the plenary session documents and the full-text contents of the speeches given in the sessions. The entity linking from the plenary sessions to entities of the MP data is already implemented, as well as linking to places, Finto ontologies and Semantic Finlex, while linking to government proposal documents, EKS, and Lakitutka will be implemented in the future. **OCR Process** In the 3. step, the data from 1907 until 1999 was available only as

 $_{\rm 251}$ $\,$ scanned images combined into PDF files, which needed to be first processed into machine-

¹⁵https://seco.cs.aalto.fi/events/2020/2020-10-29-sampo-portals/

¹⁶https://finto.fi/en/

¹⁷ https://www.eduskunta.fi/kirjasto/EKS/index.html?kieli=en

¹⁸https://lakitutka.fi

12:8 Plenary Debates as a LOD Knowledge Graph and Parla-CLARIN markup

Table 3 Semparls RDF schema for the classes Interruption, Item, Document, Session, Transcript, and ReferencedNamedEntity. Each class also contains the predicate *skos:prefLabel* that has been omitted from the table for redundancy.

Element URI	C	Range	Meaning of the value			
Interruption						
:content	1	rdfs:Literal Content of the interruption				
:interrupter	01	rdfs:Literal	Source of the interruption			
:speaker	01	bioc:Person	Interrupter URI, if interrupter was mentioned			
Item						
:session	1	:Session	Session where item on agenda			
dct:title	1	rdf:langString	Title as written in source			
:relatedDocument	0*	:Document	Document related to item			
:diary	1	rdfs:Resource	URL to online transcript			
Document						
dct:title	1	xsd:string	Name of the document			
:id	01	xsd:string	Official Parliament id			
:url	01	rdfs:Resource	URL to online transcript			
Session						
:id	1	rdfs:Literal	Session id/ session number			
dct:date	1	xsd:date	Date of the session			
:startTime	01	xsd:time	Start time of the session			
:endDate	01	xsd:date	Session end date if not same as session date			
:endTime	01	xsd:time	End time of the session			
:transcript	1	:Transcript	Transcript of the session			
Transcript						
:status	01	:Status	Status of the transcript			
:version	01	xsd:decimal	Version of the transcript			
:url	1	rdfs:Resource	URL to online transcript			
NamedEntity						
:surfaceForm	1	xsd:string	original surface forms in text			
:count	1	xsd:integer	how many times entity is mentioned in a speech			
:category	1	xsd:string	type of the named entity			
:surfaceForm	1	xsd:string	named entity in surface form			
skos:relatedMatch	0*	rdfs:Resource	links to ontologies for named entities			

readable text. The quality of the scanned documents is generally good, with older documents having partially smudged parts of the text and some pages slightly skewed. The text in the documents is formatted into two columns, with older issues separated with a black line. There is a difference in the fonts used in different years. However, both early and later years are printed with modern fonts that are easy to recognize. Most of the text is written in Finnish, however, there are some parts written in Swedish (another official language of Finland), so we needed to use a multilingual OCR model for recognition.

For the OCR, we used Tesseract 5¹⁹, with the default Finnish and Swedish models together for recognition fin+swe. The initial experiments showed that Tesseract's pre-trained models worked well with our data so we didn't need to create any training data and train new models, which simplified the whole process. Also, Tesseract's possibility to use multi-model recognition was very convenient for our dataset. As the output from the OCR process, we opted for the plain text as it seemed to be more convenient for further processing.

Since the scanned images are available in PDF files, to OCR them we needed to first transform them to PNG format. We performed the transformation with pdftopng program with 350 dpi resolution. In the initial experiments, we tried the OCR process with different

¹⁹ https://github.com/tesseract-ocr, version: 5.0.0-alpha-648-gcdebe



Figure 2 Transformation process and source datasets of Semantic Parliament.

resolutions, but the 350 dpi seemed to give the best results with pre-trained OCR models. The quality of the OCR seems to be generally good enough for our purpose. We have noticed that there are lots of mistakes in tables and lists due to Tesseract's segmentation problems. But, since we are focusing only on extracting parliamentary discussions, which are contained in the running text, we are satisfied with the OCR quality. However, during the processing of the data, we did perform some post-correction, like removing extra characters and end-of-line hyphenation, and correction of speaker names and headers.

Gathering and editing the data For the OCR-based data we decided to add one 275 manual step to the process. Every plenary session's original minutes start with a clearly 276 structured header row containing central information about the session (i.e. session number 277 and date). Where the rest of the document was in most cases laid out into two columns, 278 this header spanned both columns and was hence occasionally split or otherwise corrupted 279 in the OCR process. To considerably improve the reliability of this central metadata, we 280 chose to go through the files with the help of a printer script to spot these mangled headers 281 and manually fix them. After that all relevant data was gathered with the use of regular 282 expressions. 283

For the HTML-based data (step 3 in Fig. 2), we needed two steps to gather all the data. The HTML-based minutes were separated into a) a main page, listing the agenda, and links to possible debate pages and related documents, and b) possible debate pages that contained the actual debate related to an item on the agenda. Gathering the data required first scraping the main pages and then, based on the discussion page links found, the discussion data. Finally data from these sources needed to be reordered and combined into an integrated whole.

The XML-based data (2015–) was gathered with requests to Avoin eduskunta API that returned the minutes as JSON-wrapped XML data. The HTML- and XML-based data

12:10 Plenary Debates as a LOD Knowledge Graph and Parla-CLARIN markup

²⁹³ consisted of pre-processed elements and was mostly quite ready to use as it is. For HTML ²⁹⁴ some elements did require a few string operations to split information for separate values. ²⁹⁵ Regardless of the original format, all data was first transformed into CSV format, one ²⁹⁶ parliamentary session a file and one speech per row with columns representing the properties ²⁹⁷ of the speeches. A unique ID was created for every speech in the process.

During the history of PoF there have been cases where two parliamentary sessions refer 298 to the same calendar year. This is due to the government resigning in the middle of a 299 parliamentary session and hence ending the session prematurely. For example, there was 300 the first parliamentary session in 1975 and the second parliamentary session 1975 as well. 301 Speech and plenary session IDs related to a second parliamentary session have a $_II$ suffix 302 attached. From the year 1917 we also transformed two unofficial but historically significant 303 meetings that took place between parliamentary sessions. These speeches, sessions, and the 304 files containing them are marked with a $_XX$ suffix. 305

During editing and post-correction the speeches were cleaned of original end-of-line 306 hyphenation and other unwanted characters but the original paragraph structure was kept. 307 The clean-up results are not yet fully perfect but already usable. Some problems, like the 308 occasional page header texts (that have carried over from the PDF based data) remain 300 embedded in the speech content. Post-correction was also needed for two other notable issues 310 that, however, only concerned the PDF-based data: 1) There are cases where the speeches 311 had been wrongly split into two with the last section having incorrect metadata. 2) Speakers 312 who had not been recognised in the data enrichment step (to be described below in more 313 detail) are lacking in the metadata. This was either due to the speaker's name having been 314 corrupted in some way during the process or (more rarely) due to that the person or certain 315 form of their name is missing from the enrichment data source or original source deviating 316 from typical transcript convention. The aim of post-correction was to automatically spot 317 and fix such cases. 318

Data enrichment During the transformations into CSV the data went through many post-corrections but also data enrichments. Most notably information about the speaker was expanded using the PoF Ontology. Where not already available in the original source, we fetched from the ontology the speaker's first name and party. If not already available in source material, we also automatically created URLs for relevant documents, such as original transcripts and related documents (bills, committee reports, etc.) if such existed. Language of each speech was checked with the LAS²⁰ tool.

In order to analyze the speeches and to be able to study them in more detail, the 326 named entities in the speeches were extracted and linked to the PoF Ontology (property 327 :referencedNamedEntity in Table 2). In order to identify named entities from the speeches, 328 the data had to be modeled to preserve structure and interjections within the texts. The 329 speeches were transformed into RDF, using the NIF format²¹ for interoperability, separating 330 paragraphs and titles. The interjections were identified and marked as paragraphs, so that 331 they could be extracted from the speeches themselves. After the separation process, the data 332 can be used for morphological analysis on the speeches and interjections separately to enable 333 text analysis. This, however, remains as a future work. 334

After the speeches were transformed into RDF to preserve their structure and to separate the speeches from interjections, the RDF was used to identify named entities from the texts. The named entity extraction was done using the upgraded Nelli tool [25] and linked separately

 $^{^{20}}$ http://demo.seco.tkk.fi/las/

²¹ https://persistence.uni-leipzig.org/nlp2rdf/

to be able to take the context into account. The named entities (e.g., people, places, groups and organizations) were linked internally using the ARPA tool [17], in addition to resources in external knowledge bases, such as the Kanto²² vocabulary for Finnish actors provided by the National Library for organizations and groups, the General Finnish Ontology (YSO) for places²³ [23], PNR²⁴ gazetteer data of Finnish place names by the National Survey, and the Semantic Finlex²⁵ [18] data of the Ministry of Justice to have broader coverage for linking places, actors, and legal documents.

The subject matter keywords for each speech were extracted using Annif [24], a subject 345 indexing tool developed by the National Library of Finland (property dct:subject in Table 2). 346 The Finto REST API²⁶ offers Annif models that are pre-trained on categorical metadata 347 from Finnish libraries, museums, and archives available at the Finna service²⁷. These 348 projects provide subject keywords automatically linked to entities of the General Finnish 349 Ontology YSO. The model used for subject indexing was yso-fi, which combines lexical 350 and associative approaches, so that it is able to find terms directly present in the texts as 351 well as indirect concepts based on statistical machine learning. A list of keywords for each 352 speech was obtained using a limit of 100 keywords and a weight threshold of 0.01. 353

Parla-CLARIN Transformation The transformation to Parla-CLARIN was a fairly
 straight-forward process of creating an XML tree from the CSV data. Each file, containing
 one parliamentary session, forms its own entity, containing all session and speaker metadata
 with proper ID-linkage inside the document. We chose to separate all interruptions from the
 actual speech content by separating them to their own elements (as seen in Listing 1).

RDF Transformation From the initial CSV, the debates were also transformed into 359 RDF. For this we used the Terse RDF Triple Language (Turtle) syntax²⁸ and the schema 360 presented in Section 4. The data for one parliamentary session was recreated as three 361 different interlinked files, the first containing all the actual speeches made during that whole 362 parliamentary session and all immediate metadata such as information about the speaker 363 and the date. These link to a second file containing all the items discussed and related 364 documents and their available metadata. The third file consists of the parliamentary session's 365 plenary sessions and minutes transcripts. In the forming of URIs for the people and parties 366 we once again utilized the PoF Ontology to ensure fluent linkage between the speech and 367 prosopographical data sets. 368

369 6 Validation

The whole process extracted over 900 000 individual speeches from the whole period, from 1907 to current day. The length of a speech can vary from a single word to over thousand words in length. A completely automated process handling this much data is naturally prone to errors in dealing with exceptions in the data. At this point most validation of the result data has been manual. Currently, we are looking more deeply into the OCR results to get more concrete understanding of our success in that step of the process. Fig. 3 shows a snippet of the data in the original PDF format used and in the final text form. Apart from issues

²²https://finto.fi/finaf/en/

²³ https://finto.fi/yso-paikat/en/?clang=en

²⁴ http://www.ldf.fi/dataset/pnr

²⁵ https://data.finlex.fi

²⁶ http://api.finto.fi/

²⁷ http://www.finna.fi

²⁸ https://www.w3.org/TR/turtle/

Eduskunta yhtyy valiokunnan hylkäävään ehdotukseen. Eduskunta yhtyy valiokunnan hylkäävään ehdotukseen Asia on loppuun käsitelty. Asia on loppuun käsitelty. 10) Ehdotus toivomukseksi määrärahasta lainoiksi Uudenmaan läänin kunnille koulu-, sairaala-, asunto-10) Fhdotus toivomukseksi määrärahasta lainoiksi Judenmaan läänin kunnille kulu-, sairaala-, asunto-ja kunnallisteknillisten laitosten rakentamiseksi. Uudenmaan läänin kunnille koulu-, sairaala-, asuntoia kunnallisteknillisten laitosten takentamiseksi. Esitellään laki- ja talousvaliokunnan mie-Esitellään laki- ja talousvaliokunnan mietintö n:o 19 ja otetaan ainoaan käsittintö n:o 19 ja otetaan ainoaan käsit telyyn siinä valmistelevasti käsitelty ed. telyyn siinä valmistelevasti käsitelty ed. Kantolan ym. toiv.al. n:o 220, joka sisältää Kantolan ym. toiv.al, n:o 220, joka sisältää yllämainitun ehdotuksen. vllämainitun ehdotuksen. Puhemies: Käsittelyn pohjana on laki-Puhemies: Käsittelyn pohjana on laki. ja talousvaliokunnan mietintö n:o 19. ia talousvaliokunnan mietintö n:o 19. Keskustelu: Keskustelu: Ed. Kantola: Herra puhemies! Pidän Ed. Kantola: Herra puhemies! Pidän erittäin valitettavana sitä, että laki- ja talous-

erittäin valitettavana sitä, että laki- ja talous-

(a) Source PDF transcript of plenary session 49/1967,(b) Result text after OCR p. 885

Figure 3 Example of the source and the result after the OCR process.

described in section 5, Transformation Process, we have observed that the quality of the 377 OCR results vary from decade to decade. The quality of 1990's OCR is quite good, with very 378 little issues on relevant parts while results from the start of the 20^{th} century contain more 379 errors. The main reason for these differences is the varying quality of available images and 380 the paper the original document was printed on. A similar trend has been observed in [14]. 381

Preliminary tests on speaker recognition (i.e., that each speaker property 382 value with speaker name and other required speaker metadata associated with it) show that 383 after corrections the amount of recognized speakers tends to be over 99%. These tests were 384 performed on random parliamentary sessions from all OCR-based decades. It is good to note 385 that these numbers do not indicate whether the speaker is the correct one, as in some cases 386 the chance of incorrect name correction or split speech does remain. 387

The RDF data model of the parliamentary debates is presented in a machine-processable 388 format using the ShEx Shape Expressions language²⁹ [26]. We have made initial validation 389 experiments with PvShEx³⁰ and shex.js³¹ validators. Based on the experiments, we have 390 identified errors both in the schema and the data. The schema errors include syntax 301 errors, incorrect cardinality definitions, incorrect literal datatype definitions, and incorrect 392 namespaces for IRI values. The errors in the schema have been fixed accordingly. In the 393 data, we have found systematic issues stemming from the RDF conversion process, e.g., some 394 separate speeches and interruptions that were merged into one speech/interruption instance, 395 speeches that were attached to multiple session item and diary (should be only one), and 396 triples with an incorrectly minted object IRI (the base IRI of the Turtle file) instead of 397 omitting the value altogether. The issues have been fixed in the data conversion process. We 398 plan a full-scale ShEx validation phase integrated in the data conversion and publication 390 process to spot and report errors in the dataset. 400

²⁹ https://shex.io

³⁰ https://github.com/hsolbrig/PyShEx

³¹ https://github.com/shexSpec/shex.js

7 Publishing and Using Speeches via a Linked Open Data Service

The S-KG has been published on the Linked Data Finland platform³² [8] according to the Linked Data publishing principles and other best practices of W3C [4], including, e.g., content negotiation and provision of a SPARQL³³ endpoint³⁴.

The data will be used via the SPARQL endpoint in two ways. Firstly, a portal called 405 ParliamentSampo – Finnish Parliament on the Semantic Web is under development, a new 406 member in the Sampo series of semantic portals³⁵. The portal includes data analytic tools 407 studying parliamentary debates, networks of Finnish politicians, and political culture, and is 408 targeted to both researchers and the public for. Secondly, in addition to the ready-to-use 409 application perspectives in the ParliamentSampo portal, the underlying SPARQL endpoint 410 can and is being applied to custom data analyses in Digital Humanities research using 411 YASGUI³⁶ [22] and Python scripting in Google Colab³⁷ and Jupyter³⁸ notebooks. In our 412 work, the "FAIR guiding principles for scientific data management and stewardship" of 413 publishing Findable, Accessible, Interoperable, and Re-usable data are used³⁹. 414



One example of using the data for analysis through SPARQL endpoint is shown in Fig. 4. It represents the number of speeches on a timeline by gender. The histogram shows the speeches of male speakers with a blue bar and female speakers with an orange bar. The green bar is for speeches where the speaker has not been identified due to speaker recognition issues described earlier. The chairpersons have been filtered out as they are often mentioned

Figure 4 Total number of speeches by gender.

 $^{^{32} {\}tt https://ldf.fi}$

³³ https://www.w3.org/TR/sparql11-query/

³⁴ Access to this and the Parla-CLARIN dataset is currently restricted to consortium members.

³⁵https://seco.cs.aalto.fi/applications/sampo/

³⁶ https://yasgui.triply.cc

³⁷ https://colab.research.google.com/notebooks/intro.ipynb

³⁸ https://jupyter.org

³⁹ https://www.go-fair.org/fair-principles/

12:14 Plenary Debates as a LOD Knowledge Graph and Parla-CLARIN markup

⁴²⁰ by the title in the data and therefore cannot be linked based on the speaker data to the actor ⁴²¹ data. With this in mind, it can be seen from the plot that the number of female speeches

422 rises with time.

423 **8** Discussion & Conclusions

⁴²⁴ This paper presented the first homogeneous publication of the full set of plenary speeches
⁴²⁵ of PoF (1907-present) as a knowledge graph (S-KG) as Linked Data and in the emerging
⁴²⁶ Parla-CLARIN standard. Thus far the speeches have been available only in PDF form, as
⁴²⁷ text, in HTML, or in XML form depending on the time period and data publication.

Unlike in many other similar projects we have not focused only on a slice of existing data.
Instead we have covered and brought into an unified format the speeches from the whole of
Parliament of Finland's history. This makes it possible for any research to easily cover all of
history with a single query and brings about completely new possibilities for further data
analysis and research.

The main technical novelties in our approach w.r.t the related works discussed in Section 2 include the combined model of Parla-CLARIN and RDF developed for representing the speeches, integration of the data to the larger PoF Ontology for deeper data analyses, and enriching the data with a variety of external related national data sources to earn the 5th star according to the Linked Data 5-star model⁴⁰.

The variety of the pre-existing source formats is a key motivator for our work but also naturally a challenge. Bringing about a harmonious dataset from different sources is not a simple matter and requires familiarity with the source data. To deepen our understanding, we have also reached out to the Parliament's Central Office staff who are responsible for creating the minutes. This co-operation has been very beneficial.

The data has been published on the Linked Data Finland platform and is being used in 443 Digital Humanities Research for studying the parliamentary language and political culture 444 in the SEMPARL project and for implementing the end user applications. To earn the 6th 445 star in Linked Data Finland model extending the 5-star model for better re-usability, the 446 schema has been included and documented as part of the data publication, and to some 447 extent validated for the 7th star. The Parla-CLARIN data set has also been already taken 448 into internal use in the consortium and while still undergoing revision, both data sets have 449 proved promising and fit for use. The data and data service will be used also in the Helsinki 450 Digital Humanities Hackathon⁴¹ in May 2021 for feedback from external users. FinnParla 451 data will eventually be opened during the SEMPARL project by the open license CC BY 4.0. 452 The S-KG data will be used as a basis of the semantic portal ParliamentSampo – Finnish 453

454 Parliament on the Semantic Web that is being developed in the Semantic Parliament project,
455 based on the Sampo model [5] and Sampo-UI framework [9]. The Parla-CLARIN version
456 will also be made available to the public.

Regarding data enrichment, improvements in the keyword extraction mechanism as well
as automatic recognition of broad topics in the dataset are planned for the near future. We
also aim to further the combination of both presented formats by creating a third version of
the data as LOD using Parla-CLARIN markup for the speech contents.

Acknowledgments Thanks to Ari Apilo, Sari Wilenius, and Päivikki Karhula of PoF
 for providing material for the project. Our work was funded by the Academy of Finland as

⁴⁰ https://www.w3.org/community/webize/2014/01/17/what-is-5-star-linked-data/

⁴¹http://heldig.fi/dhh21

part of the Semantic Parliament project, the EU project InTaVia: In/Tangible European 463 Heritage⁴², and is related to the COST action NexusLinguarum⁴³ on linguistic data science. 464 CSC – IT Center for Science, Finland, provided computational resources for the work. 465

466		References
467	1	Kaspar Beelen, Timothy Alberdingk Thijm, Christopher Cochrane, Kees Halvemaan, Graeme
468		Hirst, Michael Kimmins, Sander Lijbrink, Maarten Marx, Nona Naderi, Ludovic Rheault,
469		and et al. Digitization of the canadian parliamentary debates. Canadian Journal of Political
470		Science, $50(3):849-864$, 2017. doi:10.1017/S0008423916001165.
471	2	Uldis Bojārs, Roberts Darģis, Uldis Lavrinovičs, and Pēteris Paikens. LinkedSaeima: A linked
472		open dataset of Latvia's parliamentary debates. In Maribel Acosta, Philippe Cudré-Mauroux,
473		Maria Maleshkova, Tassilo Pellegrini, Harald Sack, and York Sure-Vetter, editors, Semantic
474		Systems. The Power of AI and Knowledge Graphs, pages 50–56, Cham, 2019. Springer-Verlag.
475	3	Eduskunta. Eduskunnan täysistunnot, ladattava versio 1.5, 2017. URL: http://urn.fi/urn:
476		nbn:fi:lb-2019101721.
477	4	Tom Heath and Christian Bizer. Linked Data: Evolving the Web into a Global Data Space
478		(1st edition). Morgan & Claypool, Palo Alto, California, 2011. URL: http://linkeddatabook.
479		com/editions/1.0/.
480	5	Eero Hyvönen. "Sampo" model and semantic portals for digital humanities on the semantic web.
481		In DHN 2020 Digital Humanities in the Nordic Countries. Proceedings of the Digital Humanities
482		in the Nordic Countries 5th Conference, pages 373–378. CEUR Workshop Proceedings, vol.
483	_	2612, October 2020. URL: http://ceur-ws.org/Vol-2612/poster1.pdf.
484	6	Eero Hyvönen, Petri Leskinen, Minna Tamper, Heikki Rantala, Esko Ikkala, Jouni Tuominen,
485		and Kirsi Keravuori. Biographysampo - publishing and enriching biographies on the semantic
486		web for digital humanities research. In Pascal Hitzler, Miriam Fernández, Krzysztof Janowicz,
487		Amrapali Zaveri, Alasdair J.G. Gray, Vanessa Lopez, Armin Haller, and Karl Hammar,
488		editors, The Semantic Web. ESWC 2019, pages 574–589. Springer-Verlag, June 2019. doi:
489	7	10.1007/978-3-030-21348-0_37.
490	1	Lero Hyvonen, Minna Tamper, Arttu Oksanen, Esko Ikkala, Sami Sarsa, Jouri Tuominen,
491		logislation and ease law In The Semantic Web: FSWC 2020 Satellite Events Revised Selected
492		Papers pages 110-114 Springer-Verlag 2010
495	8	Fare Hyuönen Jouni Tuominen Mijka Alenen and Fetu Mökelö Linked Data Finland: A
494	0	7-star model and platform for publishing and re-using linked datasets. In ESWC 2011 Satellite
495		Events pages 226–230 Springer-Verlag 2014
407	9	Esko Ikkala Eero Hyvönen Heikki Bantala and Mikko Koho Sampo-III: A Full Stack
498		JavaScript Framework for Developing Semantic Portal User Interfaces. Semantic Web –
499		Interoperability, Usability, Applicability, 2021. accepted.
500	10	Kimmo Kettunen and Matti La Mela. Digging deeper into the finnish parliamentary pro-
501		tocols – using a lexical semantic tagger for studying meaning change of everyman's rights
502		(allemansrätten). In DHN 2020 Digital Humanities in the Nordic Countries. Proceedings of the
503		Digital Humanities in the Nordic Countries 5th Conference, pages 63–80. CEUR Workshop
504		Proceedings, vol. 2612, October 2020. URL: http://ceur-ws.org/Vol-2612/paper5.pdf.
505	11	Martijn Kleppe, Laura Hollink, Max Kemman, Damir Juric, Henri Beunders, Jaap Blom,
506		Johan Oomen, and Geert-Jan Houben. Polimedia: Analysing media coverage of political
507		debates by automatically generated links to radio & newspaper items. In $OKCon\ 2013$
508		LinkedUp Veni Competition on Linked and Open Data for Education, pages 63–80. CEUR

⁴²https://intavia.eu
⁴³https://nexuslinguarum.eu

12:16 Plenary Debates as a LOD Knowledge Graph and Parla-CLARIN markup

- Workshop Proceedings, vol. 1124, September 2013. URL: http://ceur-ws.org/Vol-1124/
 linkedup veni2013 04.pdf.
- linkedup_veni2013_04.pdf.
 Philipp Koehn. Europarl: A parallel corpus for statistical machine translation. In *MT summit*, volume 5, pages 79-86, 2005. URL: https://homepages.inf.ed.ac.uk/pkoehn/

⁵¹³ publications/europarl-mtsummit05.pdf.

- Mikko Koho, Lia Gasbarra, Jouni Tuominen, Heikki Rantala, Ilkka Jokipii, and Eero Hyvönen.
 AMMO Ontology of Finnish Historical Occupations. In *Proceedings of the First International Workshop on Open Data and Ontologies for Cultural Heritage (ODOCH'19)*, volume 2375, pages
 91–96. CEUR Workshop Proceedings, June 2019. URL: http://ceur-ws.org/Vol-2375/.
- Matti La Mela. Tracing the emergence of nordic allemansrätten through digitised parliamentary
 sources. In Mats Fridlund, Mila Oiva, and Petri Paju, editors, *Digital histories: Emergent approaches within the new digital history*, pages 181–197. Helsinki University Press, 2020.
 doi:10.33134/HUP-5-11.
- Emanuele Lapponi, Martin G. Søyland, Erik Velldal, and Stephan Oepen. The Talk of Norway:
 a richly annotated corpus of the Norwegian parliament, 1998–2016. Language Resources and Evaluation, 52(3):873–893, September 2018. doi:10.1007/s10579-018-9411-5.
- Petri Leskinen, Jouni Tuominen, and Eero Hyvönen. Members of parliament in finland (1907–)
 knowledge graph and its linked open data service, 2021. Submitted for review.
- Eetu Mäkelä. Combining a REST lexical analysis web service with SPARQL for mashup
 semantic annotation from text. In *Proceedings of the ESWC 2014 demonstration track*, pages
 424–428. Springer-Verlag, 2014. doi:10.1007/978-3-319-11955-7_60.
- Arttu Oksanen, Jouni Tuominen, Eetu Mäkelä, Minna Tamper, Aki Hietanen, and Eero
 Hyvönen. Semantic Finlex: Transforming, publishing, and using Finnish legislation and case
 law as linked open data on the web. In G. Peruginelli and S. Faro, editors, *Knowledge of the Law in the Big Data Age*, volume 317 of *Frontiers in Artificial Intelligence and Applications*,
 pages 212–228. IOS Press, 2019.
- Andrej Pancur and Tomaž Erjavec. The siParl corpus of Slovene parliamentary proceedings. In
 Proceedings of the Second ParlaCLARIN Workshop, pages 28-34, Marseille, France, May 2020.
 European Language Resources Association. URL: https://www.aclweb.org/anthology/2020.
 parlaclarin-1.6.
- Onni Pekonen. Debating "the ABCs of parliamentary life": the learning of parliamentary rules and practices in the late nineteenth-century Finnish Diet and the early Eduskunta.
 PhD thesis, University of Jyväskylä, Jyväskylä, 2014. URL: http://urn.fi/URN:ISBN:
 978-951-39-5843-5.
- ⁵⁴³ 21 Christian Rauh, Pieter De Wilde, and Jan Schwalbach. The ParlSpeech data set: Annotated
 ⁵⁴⁴ full-text vectors of 3.9 million plenary speeches in the key legislative chambers of seven
 ⁵⁴⁵ European states, 2017. doi:10.7910/DVN/E4RSP9.
- Laurens Rietveld and Rinke Hoekstra. The YASGUI family of SPARQL clients. Semantic
 Web, 8(3):373-383, 2017.
- Katri Seppälä and Eero Hyvönen. Asiasanaston muuttaminen ontologiaksi. Yleinen suomalainen ontologia esimerkkinä FinnONTO-hankkeen mallista (Changing a keyword thesaurus into an ontology. General Finnish Ontology as an example of the FinnONTO model). Technical report, National Library, Plans, Reports, Guides, March 2014. URL: https://www.doria.fi/handle/10024/96825.
- Osma Suominen. Annif: DIY automated subject indexing using multiple algorithms. *LIBER Quarterly*, 29(1):1-25, 2019. URL: http://www.liberquarterly.eu/article/10.18352/lq.
 10285/, doi:10.18352/lq.10285.
- Minna Tamper, Arttu Oksanen, Jouni Tuominen, Aki Hietanen, and Eero Hyvönen. Automatic
 annotation service APPI: Named entity linking in legal domain. In *Proceedings of ESWC* 2020, Posters and Demos. Springer-Verlag, 2020.
- Katherine Thornton, Harold Solbrig, Gregory S. Stupp, Jose Emilio Labra Gayo, Daniel
 Mietchen, Eric Prud'hommeaux, and Andra Waagmeester. Using shape expressions (ShEx)

- to share RDF data models and to guide curation with rigorous validation. In Pascal Hitzler,
 Miriam Fernández, Krzysztof Janowicz, Amrapali Zaveri, Alasdair J.G. Gray, Vanessa Lopez,
 Armin Haller, and Karl Hammar, editors, *The Semantic Web. ESWC 2019*, pages 606–620.
- ⁵⁶⁴ Springer-Verlag, 2019. doi:10.1007/978-3-030-21348-0_39.
- Jouni Tuominen, Eero Hyvönen, and Petri Leskinen. Bio CRM: A data model for representing
 biographical data for prosopographical research. In *Biographical Data in a Digital World* (*BD2017*), 2017. URL: https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.1040712.
- Astrid van Aggelen, Laura Hollink, Max Kemman, Martijn Kleppe, and Henri Beunders. The
 debates of the European Parliament as Linked Open Data. Semantic Web, 8(2):271–281, 2017.
 doi:10.3233/SW-160227.
- Eero Voutilainen. Tekstilajitietoista kielenhuoltoa: puheen esittäminen kirjoitettuna eduskun nan täysistuntopöytäkirjoissa. In Liisa Tiittula and Pirkko Nuolijärvi, editors, *Puheesta tekstiksi Puheen kirjallisen esittämisen alueita, keinoja ja rajoja*, pages 162–191. Suomalaisen Kirjallisuuden Seura, 2016.